



Confidential: Not for publication

CHIPINGE TOWN COUNCIL

MINUTES OF THE PROCUREMENT EVALUATION COMMITTEE FOR THE SUPPLY AND DELIVERY OF LIGHT MOTOR VEHICLES HELD IN THE TOWN COUNCIL BOARDROOM ON THURSDAY 8 AUGUST 2024 AT 11HOURS

Present

Mr D Popi
Mr T Punyuka
Mr P Chivhezani
Mr W Mlambo
Mrs P Taedzerwa
Miss M Makacha
Mr P Kochiwe
Mr P Chindanya
Ms T. Chaparapata
Mr E Makamera
Mr T Maoneke
Ms P Sithole

Designation/ Organisation

Acting Town Engineer (Chairing)
Chief Security Officer
Procurement Officer
Procurement Graduate Trainee
Acting Internal Auditor
Procurement Intern
Civil Engineering Technician- Water
Committee Intern
Committee Officer
Procurement Officer
Community Services Officer
Committee Intern

By invitation

Mrs P Taedzerwa
Mr Machuwaire -
Mr Musapingura

Acting Internal Auditor
Chipinge High School Headmaster
Chipinge High School SDC Chairperson

1.0 CONSTITUTION OF THE MEETING.

The meeting was duly constituted at 1100 hours with an opening prayer from Mr W Mlambo. The Chairperson gave Mr P Chivhezani the floor to facilitate the proceedings of meeting and introduced all members who were present.

2.0 PURPOSE OF THE MEETING

Tender opening and Evaluation of bids submitted electronically

3.0. Tender opening results

The process was conducted using council LED Television in the Main Boardroom for every participant to clearly view the opening results

Name of bidder	Prices of bidders
Faramatsi	USD 356717.00
Clover Leaf Motors	USD 239000.00
Croco	USD 252414.00
Sypremo	USD 242500.00
Duly	USD 301006.00
Byword	USD 350755.00

4. Tender evaluation for the supply and delivery of Light motor vehicles CTC0022

4.1 Mandatory documents

Name of document required	FARAMATSI	SYPREMO	CROCO MOTORS	BYWORD	CLOVER LEAF MOTOR	DULY
Certificate of incorporation	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES
Tax Clearance certificate	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES
NSSA Certificate	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES
PRAZ Certificate for the appropriate category	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES
BID SECURING DECLARATION	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES
BID SUBMISSION SHEET	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES
BRONCHURE	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES ✓	✓ YES
3MONTHS BANK STATEMENT	✓ YES	Bank statement Not current	Bank statement Not current	Bank statement Not current	✓ YES	✓ YES
TRADE REFERENCE 3	✓ YES	2/3	✓ YES	✓ YES	✓ YES	2/3

Four bidders were not successful after the first stage of evaluation, namely:

1. Sypremo did not submit current bank statement and the bid was rejected
2. Croco did not submit current bank statement and the bid was rejected
3. Byword did not submit current bank statement and the bid was rejected
4. Duly motors only submitted two trade references instead of three and the bid was rejected

4.2 Technical evaluation

The tender is a single lot tender

Item	Technical specifications	Faramatsi	Clover leaf
1	Sedan	Compliant	Compliant
2	Pick-up trucks	Not Compliant	Not Compliant
3	Double cab for Chipinge High School	Compliant	Compliant
4	Double cabs for CTC	Compliant	Compliant

Technical evaluation was concluded after noting that both bidders had quoted vehicles in lot 2 with wrong specifications. The technical specifications required bidders to quote pick-up trucks with not more than 2 litre engine capacity and to submit brochures of the same vehicles. On this lot the target vehicles were those equivalent to Nissan NP200 pick-up trucks which fall within 2 litre engine capacity

1. Faramatsi Motors P/L quoted Toyota Single cabs for lot 2 according to the brochures submitted and the minimum engine capacity for Toyota Pick-up trucks is 2.4 litres which is not the required specifications of not more than 2 litres engine capacity
2. Nissan Clover Leaf Motors P/L quoted Nissan Navara Single cabs according to the brochures submitted and the minimum engine capacity for Nissan Navara pick-up trucks is 2.5 litres which is not the required specifications

The committee rejected the vehicles offered by both bidders for lot 2 after close analysis of the brochures and accepted all the other lots 1, 3 and 4

4.3 Financial evaluation of responsive bids

Name of bidder	Prices of bidders
FARAMATSI MOTORS 33Edison Crescent Graniteside ngoni@faramasimotors.co.zw	
Sedan vehicle x2	81674
Double cab for Chipinge high x1	68709
Double cab x2	137418
Total=	287 801
CLOVER LEAF MOTORS	

82 Mutare Road Msasa, Harare vehiclesalesadmin@cloverleaf.co.zw	
Sedan vehicles x 2	40000
Double-cab for Chipinge High School x1	39000
Double-cab x 2	100000
Total =	179000

4.4 Recommendation

That a due diligence visit be conducted to the shortlisted bidders before awarding the tender for the supply and delivery of new light motor vehicles

5. Adjournment of the meeting to conduct due diligence visit to the shortlisted bidders

The meeting ended at 1628hrs

6. REPORT ON THE PROCUREMENT DUE DILIGENCE VISIT HELD IN THE TOWN COUNCIL BOARDROOM ON WEDNESDAY 28TH AUGUST 2024

6.1 DUE DILIGENCE VISIT REPORT

Tender No. CTC0022 Supply and delivery of brand new light vehicles

Present

Designation/Organization

Present

Designation/Organization

Mr D. Popi
Mr P Chivhezani
Mr T. Punyuka
Ms T. Chaparapata
Mr L. Mlambo
Mr L. Gwenzi

Acting Town Engineer (Chairing)
Procurement Officer
Chief Security Officer
Committee Officer
Acting Accountant
Workshop Foreman

By Invitation

Mr J. Machuwaire
Mr Mutendadzamera
Mr W. Musapingura

Chipinge High School
Chipinge High School
Chipinge High School

6.1 Preamble

The due diligence visit was carried out following the Evaluation of bids which were submitted electronically for the supply and delivery of light vehicles, tender CTC 0022 Lot 1 to 4 for the.

6.2 Purpose of the due diligence visit

The main purpose of the visit was;

- 6.3 To identify the suppliers' physical location and whether it is not a briefcase company.
- 6.4 To check the existence of workshops to support after sale services and repairs with specifications preferred by Council as specified in the tender document.
- 6.5 To confirm the suppliers' reputation and capacity to supply the product(s) by checking whether the bidder has rolling stock in its bonded warehouse and showrooms.

7. Proceedings of the visitation and findings

The Procurement team arrived at Nissan Clover Leaf at 0900 hours and that marked the beginning of their due diligence visits to the two selected companies as detailed below;

Bidder's name and physical addresses	Cloverleaf Motors 82 Mutare Road, Msasa, Harare Email: vehiclesalesadmin@cloverleaf.co.zw
Product(s) to supply and Bid price(s)	<p>Lot 1 - Sedan vehicles – Nissan Almera x 2 total cost US\$40,000.00</p> <p>Lot 3 – Double cab vehicle – Nissan Navara x 1 total cost US\$39,000.00</p> <p>Lot 4 – Double cab vehicle – Nissan Navara x 2 total costs US\$100,000.00</p>
<i>Ownership, Trade experience and capacity</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Procurement Evaluation delegation met Mr Dereck Mazvito, the Marketing Manager and his assistant Mr Donald Taga. - The Procurement team introduced themselves and explained the purpose of the due diligence visit following the opening of the tender CTC0022 for the supply and delivery of light vehicles (Lot 1 to 4). In addition, the team would assess capacity of the supplier to deliver as per tender specifications. - Nissan Cloverleaf confirmed having branches in Kwekwe, Bulawayo and Victoria Falls and their Head Office was in Harare. - Therefore, the team toured the showroom, then to the workshop site, the bonded warehouse and the spares backup. - The team also appreciated the stock availability as they had an opportunity to view the single cab three seater pick up vehicles, the Sedan Almera 1,5L manual among other vehicles. However, they had no double cab vehicles ex-stock but would need 4 weeks to get the vehicles delivered from South Africa. - They confirmed having their pricing differentials because of the various ranges an example given is of a NAVARA with about 13 ranges and the prices depends on each model specifications. - Chipinge High School questioned the specifications of the Lot 3 vehicle and was advised of the vehicle being an SE model 4 x 2

	<p>manual with no camera and rear sensors yet their preference was for a vehicle with a manual transmission gearbox.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - They also noted the advantages of having a 4x4 over a 4x2 wheel driver. - Had demo units for tests if need be.
<i>Product availability,</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - They operate on rolling stock and confirmed that they were able to supply all the vehicles except the single cabs in lot 2 which they indicated that from their range of vehicles there is no one which matches those specifications - Their reason was that the specifications for the single cabs in lot 2 only match those of Nissan NP200 which have since been phased out from the market by Nissan Motor Co, Ltd and in place of the NP200 they quoted Nissan Navara 2.5 Liter diesel which is different from those required by Chipinge Town Council (1.5 to 2 liters engine capacity).
<p>Observations</p> <p>It was observed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - That Nissan Cloverleaf is a major dealer for the Nissan vehicles cited having supplied local authorities and other quasi government and parastatals - That their prices were VAT inclusive, with the registration cost and first term vehicle licensing. - That the bidder was ready to supply all the vehicles except the single cabs in lot 2 which were no longer available in the market after being phased out by Nissan Motor Co, Ltd. Which is the 1.5 liter – 2 liter engine capacity 	
Bidder's name and physical addresses	<p>Faramatsi Motors</p> <p>33 Edson Crescent, Graniteside</p> <p>Harare. Email:ngoni@faramatsimotors.co.zw</p>
Bid price	<p>Lot 1 - Sedan vehicles x 2 total cost US\$81,674.00</p> <p>Lot 2 – Pick up truck x 2 total cost US\$68,916.00</p> <p>Lot 3 – Double cab vehicle x 1 total cost US\$68,709.00</p> <p>Lot 4 – Double cab vehicle x 2 total costs US\$137,418.00</p>
<i>Ownership, Trade</i>	<p>The Procurement Evaluation delegation met Mr John Mukosi</p>

<p><i>experience and capacity</i></p>	<p>The Chairperson led the self-introductions and explained the purpose of the visit, which was to establish existence of the bidder, physical location and supplier capacity through evidence by availability of rolling stock in bonded warehouse and showrooms</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Faramatsi expressed their company having five years in existence and have a dealership for the Toyota products and could also supply higher buses and cited the Government as their major client as they supplied vehicles to the Parliament and still expected to deliver about 172 vehicles on the same Parly Scheme. They indicated that their contract with parliament of Zim will see them getting a bank loan to finance the delivery of the vehicles to Parliament. Therefore, had to seek bank guaranteed loans with the bankers name supplied. That only proves their company being well capacitated financially. Had their Director Farai Matsika being a shareholder with AMTEC one of the leading motor companies in Zimbabwe. - Had their vehicles assembled in South Africa, some in Dubai delivered in single unit via Durban. Had another branch along Samora Machel Avenue and another showroom and a workshop and bonded warehouse in Graniteside. - However, had some restrictions to access the bonded warehouse as they need clearance by ZIMRA hence limited access still remained?
<p><i>Product availability,</i></p>	<p>Confirmed having the capacity to supply all the vehicles except the single cabs in lot 2 which they indicated were not available on their range of vehicles. They only have single cabs which range from 2.4 liters and above and they do not match our specifications for single cabs in lot 2</p>
<p>Observations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Faramatsi confirmed being dealers of Toyota and Suzuki products only while their sister company AMTEC can also offer the Nissan products. - The Company is appearing having the capacity to supply as they cited the previous Parliamentary Scheme where they managed to supply 130 vehicles and among other deals with the Government, they managed to supply 34 ambulances to the Ministry of Health and Child Care. - They are not able to supply vehicles in lot 2 for Single cabs since they do not supply vehicles with such specifications, thus, single cabs with 1.5L to 2L engine capacity - They are able to offer new vehicle sales and aftersales support. 	

- Fixing of accessories does not affect warranty of the product but also the need to have the immediate fixing of bull bars, anti-roll bars for security reason and the canopying in order to enhance color matching and to maintain quality.

8. General remarks

The Procurement Evaluation Committee, based on observations conclusively agreed to that;

- Council to consider the two bidders and affordable products in terms of pricing as both companies had proven having the capacity to supply and deliver the required products given their presentations and the Procurement Evaluation Committee observations.

9. End of visitation

The due diligence visit ended as the Procurement Evaluation Committee returned to Chipinge.

10. Financial evaluation of responsive bidders

10.1 Faramatsi P/L

Item	Description	Quantity	Unit price (USD)	Total Price (USD)
Lot 1	Toyota Corolla sedan	2	40 837	81 674
Lot 2	Toyota single cab 2.4 liter diesel engine – does not match engine capacity specifications required	1	-	-
Lot 3	Toyota Double cab GD6	1	68 709	68 709
Lot 4	Toyota double cab GD6	2	68 709	137 418
				USD287 801

10.2 Clover Leaf Motors P/L

Item	Description	Quantity	Unit price (USD)	Total Price (USD)
Lot 1	Nissan Almera sedan	2	20 000	40 000
Lot 2	Nissan Navara cab 2.5 L Diesel – does not match engine capacity specifications required	1	-	-
Lot 3	Nissan Navara Double cab	1	39 000	39 000
Lot 4	Nissan Navara Double cab	2	50 000	100 000
				USD179 000

11. Recommendations

It was recommended that;

1. The supply and delivery of New Light Motor Vehicles with Tender Number CTC0022 be awarded as follows;
 - i. 2 X Sedan vehicles (Nissan Almera) be awarded to Clover leaf Motors at a total cost of USD40 000
 - ii. 2 X Single cab vehicles be cancelled because all bidders were not responsive to this lot
 - iii. 1 X Double cab vehicle (Nissan Navara LE model) for Chipinge High School be awarded to Clover leaf Motors at a total cost of USD39 000
 - iv. 2 X Double cab vehicles (Nissan Navara SE model) be awarded to Clover Leaf Motors at a total cost of USD100 000
2. If Clover leaf P/L fails to perform the contract after award, the tender will be cancelled because the prices offered by the alternative bidder, Faramatsi P/L are beyond Council Budget for this procurement requirement

12. Closing of the meeting

The meeting ended on the 28th of August 2024 at 1240hrs with a closing prayer from Mr Gwenzi

13. PRAZ - Special Procurement Oversight Committee Review (SPOC)

- i. This tender was subjected to Review by SPOC and the recommendations were upheld through **SPOC Resolution No 0679** through a letter dated 08 October 2024. In view of the SPOC Resolution, Nissan Clover leaf was awarded the tender for the Supply and Delivery of Light Motor Vehicles, Tender No CTC0022 in lot 1, 3 and 4 at a total cost of USD179 000.
- ii. Lot 2 was cancelled because all bidders were not responsive to this tender